



Design Review Board

**Tuesday, August 13, 2019
Council Chambers – Lower Level
57 East 1st Street
4:30 PM**

A work session of the Design Review Board was held at the City of Mesa Council Chamber – Lower Level, 57 East 1st Street at 4:30 p.m.

Board Members Present:

Chair Randy Carter
Vice Chair Scott Thomas
Boardmember Sean Banda
Boardmember Nicole Posten-Thompson
Boardmember J. Seth Placko
Boardmember Jeanette Knudsen
Boardmember Tanner Green

Board Members Absent:

Staff Present:

Nana Appiah, AICP, Planning Director
Tom Ellsworth, Pricipal Planner
Lesley Davis, Senior Planner
Heather Omta, Planning Assistant
Lisa Davis, AICP, Planner II
Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II
Cassidy Welch, Planner I

Others Present:

Councilmember Jen Duff
Jessica Potter
Jeff McVay
Angelica Guevara

A. **Call to order**

Chair Randy Carter welcomed everyone to the Work Session at 4:31p.m. Boardmember Banda attended the meeting via telephone and exited the meeting at 5:53p.m. Boardmember Placko joined the meeting at 4:36p.m.

B. **Downtown ASU Presentation and discussion**

Diane Jacobs with Holly Street Studios Architects presented the Downtown ASU Project. She explained that this is a partnership with ASU for Herberger Institute for Design: Digital Media Arts program. The design of the building ties in the art program elements with downtown touches. The project is larger with a park adjacent to the City Plaza building, but this discussion is focused on the building for ASU. The park plan will come later. Currently, they are in the in the schematic design phase and materials are being evaluated for durability, longevity, and cost.

Steven Chaitow, Principal, with Bohlin Cywinski Jackson (BCJ), contributed to the presentation by explaining it is a 3-story building. He said initially the building was going to be more stories. The ground floor was revised to accommodate production studios and public spaces (café, community space, conference room space). There is rear access with bays to accommodate loading of production equipment from the ground floor. The north side access will be an active alley. The revisions helped reduce vibration in the studio areas, cost, one less elevator, and improved overall design. The building will use a lot of energy and they will offset energy consumption with use of photovoltaics. The redesign lifted the production spaces up; lightened up the lower spaces to the exterior with the use of glass and lighting. Low resolutions on the screens can be used for outside projections; LED lighting behind the slats in the building's exterior will add visual effect

- ❖ Chair Carter asked, “is there a possibility that the design will dramatically change?” Ms. Jacobs advised the board that the massing of the building is well set on the site. The building exterior design is tied to the arrangement of inside elements. Therefore, they don’t anticipate much change in the building as the design is finalized. Chair Carter added the building is a nice addition to the city.
- ❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson commented “I don’t see downtown parking”. And asked, “where is the parking?” (Jeff McVay addressed the parking questions) She also noticed minimal landscape and a lot of concrete and asphalt; mostly concrete between the new buildings. Mr. Chaitow stated that the concrete feel comes from the need for an active alley and preserving as much parking as possible. The outside edges of the site are landscaped; however, the alley and parking area make it seem like there is more concrete than landscaping on the site plan. Boardmember Posten-Thompson voiced that she likes the building design.
- ❖ Jeff McVay, City Downtown Project Manager, addressed parking question. The parking solution will be the City’s role to determine and resolve. Mr. McVay stated that there is enough parking in existing parking structures and parking lots throughout the downtown area. Displaced employee parking will be relocated to parking structures. There will be minor on-street parking changes on the north side of the parcel. A variety of city sites, including the convention center have additional parking available. The current parking inventory is sufficient as is; however, the city will restructure the downtown parking program to create more parking where the need arises.
- ❖ Boardmember Green raised concerns about noise pollution and the outdoor venue capability? The concern was addressed by Mr. Chaitow who stated that the project anticipates the use of directable speakers throughout the site to combat noise travel during exterior screen use.
- ❖ Boardmember Banda feels this is a beautiful building.

C. Discuss and Provide Direction Regarding Design Review cases

Item A.1.

DRB19-00233

Within the 8300 block of East Baseline Road

Location:

Located north of Baseline Road, east of Sossaman Road. (3.9 ± acres).

Request:

Review of a group commercial center for multiple buildings.

Applicant:

RKAA Architects

Staff Planner:

Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II

Council District:

6

(Continuance to the September 10, 2019 meeting)

Item A.2.

DRB19-00344 **Within the 7200 block of South Ellsworth Road (west side) and the 9100 block of East Pecos Road (south side).**

Location: Located at the southwest corner of Pecos Road and Ellsworth Road. (2.4± acres).

Request: This request will allow for the development of a convenience store with associated fuel station.

Applicant: Michael Buschbacher, Hunter Engineering Inc.

Staff Planner: Cassidy Welch, Planner I

Council District: 6

Staff Planner Cassidy Welch presented case for a new convenience store and fuel station at the southwest corner of Pecos and Ellsworth. She explained that the proposal features a proposed convenience store and gas canopy and that the design is consistent with two other developments that were recently approved. New elevations were presented, and Cassidy explained that the masonry has been changed from split faced CMU to Mesa Stone and the canopy had been staggered. Large scale industrial is anticipated to the west, but no formal submittals have been made.

Applicant, Mike Wishbacker, Hunter Engineering represented the project and states that they are introducing a new concept for their stores into the Arizona market, similar to QT or Circle K. He explained that this will be the first new build of a Speedway in Arizona and that the new design has modern clean lines with simple materials.

❖ Chair Carter:

- Not a lot of movement, very flat
- Back façade should have a decorative element
- Underplayed design on the canopy
- Materials are nice on the buildings
- Columns need to be wrapped or supplemented in size
- Need a larger overhang or more movement over the entry

❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:

- Rear elevation needs more consideration
- Likes the materials and overall look

❖ Vice Chair Thomas:

- Likes the material however concerned with dust collecting on the wall material
- Thickness of middle canopy is odd
- Suggested hidden decking on middle canopy
- Gas tank vent lines; recommends the lines run up a column instead through the landscape
- Wrap columns with CMU to cover vent lines
- Canopy columns are too thin

❖ Boardmember Knudson:

- Likes the varying heights on building and canopies
- Likes how the middle canopy doesn't interfere with the front of the buildings

- ❖ Boardmember Placko:
 - Doesn't see parking lot screen walls on the plan; do they match the character of the building? Ms. Welch clarified the screen walls will match and are part of the overall development guidelines.
 - Watch use of thorny material where pedestrians walk

- ❖ Boardmember Green:
 - Likes the wrapped columns idea
 - Use a shading material rather than a translucent material for shading on fueling stations

- ❖ Boardmember Banda:
 - Suggested using the Mesa Stone up the pillars rather than veneer
 - Very flat design
 - Left façade is uninteresting
 - Add outdoor seating or dining with shade for patrons and employees
 - Standard signage, doesn't compliment the modern architecture
 - Cautions the brightness of the lighting
 - Use more interesting light fixtures and avoid wall packs in visible locations

Item A.3.

DRB19-00366 **Within the 2000 block of West Riverview Auto Drive (west side) and within the 2000 block of West Cubs Way (north side)**

Location: Located south of the 202 Red Mountain Freeway and west of Dobson Road. (8.6± acres).

Request: This request will allow for the development of an office building and parking structure.

Applicant: Mike Edwards, Davis

Staff Planner: Lesley Davis, Senior Planner

Council District: 1

Senior Planner, Lesley Davis, presented the case for the Union at Riverview. She explained that the proposed project is within the area that was planned with the stadium for the Chicago Cubs and Riverview Park at the northwest corner of Dobson Road and Rio Salado Parkway. The proposed project includes a 248,000 s.f. office building with an associated parking structure. The City has established agreements on this site for parking. Future plans anticipate a quad of buildings, which will be reviewed by the Board. Lesley presented revised elevations to the Board.

Applicant and architect, Mike Edwards, with Davis: stated revision added more interesting elements, underlit benches, more hardscape, inner scape play. If the project takes off, future buildings will be taller. Wants to make this an attractive space. Mechanical units on the roof. Other sites dictated where the parking structure was placed.

❖ Chair Carter:

- Building is OK
- Garage is under designed compared to the building
- Garage design needs more attention
- Consider flamboyancy in the design of the garage
- Wished the building had height

❖ Vice Chair Thomas:

- Massing and size of parking garage is extremely large
- Garage needs design elements
- Not supportive of plain concrete parking garage
- Wants to see more colors
- Suggests adding vertical and horizontal articulations
- Parking structure will dwarf buildings

❖ Boardmember Banda:

- Suburban office building.
- Going to see parking structure from 202
- Rather boring, not reading as well as it should for the location

- ❖ Boardmember Placko:
 - Confirmed location of the storm water, which is under the garage
 - Not enthusiastic about hard scape braided feature on the north side of the building along the freeway
 - Suggests adding trees to north side of the building rather than walking paths for noise and shielding from freeway
 - Does not recommend Shamel Ashes along the entry drive

- ❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:
 - Design of the office building and parking structures falls flat; want to see a standout project
 - Wants to see the design improved with more interesting features
 - This building should have a presence along the freeway
 - Project will be highly visible from 202 as well and local roadways with the many visitors coming to Cubs Stadium.
 - Easy to miss Riverview from 202 because of its underwhelming building design and lack of large screens or bold signage.
 - Building design feels like a sea of glass but doesn't compete well with Tempe glass buildings
 - Needs height (more stories)

- ❖ Boardmember Knudsen:
 - Likes the hard scape
 - Both building and garage are boxy and missing interesting architectural elements

- ❖ Boardmember Green:
 - Asked the applicant to consider the glass reflectivity on the north and west elevation and how it will impact drivers on the 202 at sunset.

Item A.4.

DRB19-00384

Within the 5600 block of East Longbow Parkway (south side)

Location: Located north of McDowell Road and west of Recker Road. (3.2± acres).

Request: This request will allow for the development of a hotel.

Applicant: Matthew Kosednar

Staff Planner: Cassidy Welch, Planner II

Council District: 5

Staff Planner, Cassidy Welch, presented case for a proposed hotel with a walking trail within the existing Longbow development. She stated that staff had no major concerns with the proposed design.

Applicant, Matthew Kosednar, described the project is a branded hotel and is designed with added depth and movement. He explained that they added movement to the parapet and brow. The mechanical in the center of the roof and the units are disguised under the windows with decorative louvers.

❖ Chair Carter:

- Look at design of the Porte Cochere, the columns are very understated.
- Add interest to canopy

❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:

- Likes the materials, shapes and forms
- Not a big fan of the stack stone

❖ Boardmember Knudsen:

- Likes the materials
- Doesn't like the stack stone

❖ Boardmember Green:

- Confirmed the use of anodized aluminum on the louvers

❖ Boardmember Placko:

- Plant palette fits area and is very desert friendly
- Watch thorny plants near parking

Item A.5.

DRB19-00394 **Within the 2600 block of West Guadalupe Road and within the 2800 block of South Carriage Lane**

Location: Located east of Price Road on the south side of Guadalupe Road. (1.2 ± acres).

Request: Review of a convenience store with gas pumps and fuel canopy that includes a drive-thru coffee facility.

Applicant: Angie Grendahl

Staff Planner: Wahid Alam, AICP, Planner II

Council District: 3

Staff Planner, Wahid Alam, presented the project and explained that they will be tearing down two office existing office buildings to accommodate the proposed convenience store with a drive-thru and fuel facility

The applicant, Angie Grendahl with Thompson Thrift Retail Group presented the case. She explained that the concept is from the Midwest. They are looking to incorporate a drive thru coffee with the convenience store and fuel facility to establish a one stop shop. She stated that they have revised the elevations to be cohesive and they tucked the building back to conceal noise and smell from residential areas.

Resident, Alan Guthrie, 2701 W. Oro Ave., expressed concern with the added traffic for a convenience store and gas station. He said it is a very busy with traffic already. He stated he lives 5 blocks away. He is worried about the trash located next to Carriage Lane. He said he was not impressed with the design of the buildings and they didn't look modern or interesting.

❖ Boardmember Banda:

- Stated it seemed counter intuitive to take office buildings and putting up a convenience store / gas station
- Canopy to the street
- Very busy intersection
- Access is a huge part of the design
- Will have restricted access and high traffic during peak traffic hours
- Not a fan of trash on Carriage Lane
- Design is flat
- It captures the Midwest well but not unique enough for Mesa, AZ
- No lighting plan shown on site, just on the street
- There is a lot going on in a small space
- Screen wall was ok

❖ Boardmember Posten-Thompson:

- Agrees with Boardmember Banda, unusual use for location
- Not a fan of the front entry with the columns coming down and floating on the glass
- Mix of colors is dark, no shadow lines
- Canopy is thin and understated
- Monument sign- 1990's / 2000 sign, needs architectural elements, but understands they don't control the design of that sign since it is not on their property
- Requests traffic study

- ❖ Vice Chair Thomas:
 - Not much depth to backside or front of the building
 - Ok with canopy
 - Conceal fuel vent lines

- ❖ Boardmember Knudsen:
 - Wants to see more colors

- ❖ Boardmember Placko:
 - Plant pallet doesn't fit Arizona
 - Grass in the right-of-way is against state law
 - Bradford Pears will not survive Arizona heat
 - Regal Mist is good
 - Mostly high-water use plants on plan (hibiscus, rose, etc.), which is not desired or allowed in the right-of-way
 - Need decomposed granite specification
 - Placement of plants are fine; species just need to be revised

- ❖ Chair Carter:
 - Supports moving the trash
 - Needs a makeover for a much more interesting building
 - Too flat
 - Choose materials that are more conducive to this area
 - Encouraged design that has more of an Arizona look than midwestern style convenience store

- ❖ Boardmember Green:
 - Asked some clarifying questions on signage

D. Consider the Minutes from the 7/9/2019 meeting

Boardmember Posten-Thompson motioned to approve last month's minutes, Boardmember Placko seconded. Approved, all in favor.

E. Discuss and take action on the following Design Review case

None

F. Other Business

None

G. Adjournment

Boardmember Posten-Thompson motioned for adjournment, Boardmember Knudsen seconded. Meeting adjourned at 6:16 p.m.

The City of Mesa is committed to making its public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. For special accommodations, please contact the City Manager's Office at (480) 644- 3333 or AzRelay 7-1-1 at least 48 hours in advance of the meeting. **Si necesita asistencia o traducción en español, favor de llamar al menos 48 horas antes de la reunión al 480-644- 2767.**